



**DISCRIMINATION LAW:  
EQUALITY IN THE PRIVATE SECTOR**

2003-2004

Volume III

Professor Denise Réaume

Faculty of Law  
University of Toronto



**DISCRIMINATION LAW:**  
**EQUALITY IN THE PRIVATE SECTOR**

2003-2004

Volume III

Professor Denise Réaume

I am grateful to Mark Hart and Geri Sanson for permission to use some of the ideas from their revised version of these materials in use at Osgoode Hall Law School, and to Carlin McGoogan, Alison Gray, and Revital Goldhar for their invaluable research assistance and production help.



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

# DISCRIMINATION LAW: EQUALITY IN THE PRIVATE SECTOR

2003-2004

## Table of Contents

### PART III cont'd: ADVANCED ISSUES IN HUMAN RIGHTS LITIGATION

#### 7. A CLOSER LOOK AT 'BONA FIDE REQUIREMENTS', 'REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION', AND 'UNDUE HARDSHIP'

|                                                                                                         |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <i>Re Dominion Colour Corp. and Teamsters Chemical, Energy and Allied Workers,<br/>Local 1880</i> ..... | 493 |
| <i>Pannu v. Skeena Cellulose</i> .....                                                                  | 508 |
| <i>Entrop v. Imperial Oil</i> .....                                                                     | 519 |
| Note: <i>Oak Bay Marina v. B.C. (H.R.T.)</i> .....                                                      | 534 |
| <i>O.H.R.C., Policy and Guidelines on Disability and the Duty to Accommodate</i> .....                  | 535 |
| <i>Nixon v. Vancouver Rape Relief Society</i> .....                                                     | 556 |
| <i>Kearney v. Bramalea Ltd</i> .....                                                                    | 561 |

#### 8. EXEMPTIONS FROM THE DUTY NOT TO DISCRIMINATE: CONFLICTS BETWEEN HUMAN RIGHTS

|                                                                                       |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <i>Caldwell v. St. Thomas Aquinas High School</i> .....                               | 577 |
| <i>Garrod v. Rhema Christian Schools</i> .....                                        | 587 |
| <i>Parks v. Christian Horizons</i> .....                                              | 606 |
| Note: <i>Trinity Western University v. British Columbia College of Teachers</i> ..... | 614 |
| <i>Ross v. New Brunswick School District No. 15</i> .....                             | 616 |
| <i>Brillinger v. Brockie</i> .....                                                    | 627 |
| <i>Nixon v. Vancouver Rape Relief Society</i> .....                                   | 634 |

#### 9. SEXUAL HARASSMENT: THE FAULT STANDARD REVISITED

|                                                                                                                                   |     |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| Colleen Sheppard, "Systemic Inequality and Workplace Culture: Challenging the<br>Institutionalization of Sexual Harassment" ..... | 639 |
| <i>Re Canada Post Corp. and Canadian Union Of Postal Workers (Gibson)</i> .....                                                   | 644 |
| <i>Re Ottawa Board of Education &amp; Ottawa Board of Education Employees' Union</i> .....                                        | 647 |
| <i>Re Treasury Board (Employment and Immigration Canada) and Broomfield</i> .....                                                 | 652 |

|                                                       |                                                                                                                             |     |
|-------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
|                                                       | <i>Aragona v. Elegant Lamp Co. and Fillipitto</i> .....                                                                     | 662 |
|                                                       | Fay Faraday, “Dealing with Sexual Harassment in the Workplace: The Promise and Limitations of Human Rights Discourse” ..... | 669 |
|                                                       | Kathleen A. Kenealy, “Sexual Harassment and the Reasonable Woman Standard”.....                                             | 677 |
|                                                       | <i>Canada (Human Rights Comm.) v. Canada (Armed Forces) and Franke</i> .....                                                | 681 |
| <b>PART IV: BEYOND THE INDIVIDUAL COMPLAINT MODEL</b> |                                                                                                                             |     |
| <b>10.</b>                                            | <b>THE SHIFT TO A SYSTEMIC FOCUS</b>                                                                                        |     |
|                                                       | William Black, <i>Employment Equality: A Systemic Approach</i> .....                                                        | 691 |
|                                                       | <i>Robichaud v. The Queen</i> .....                                                                                         | 694 |
|                                                       | <i>Hinds v. Canada Employment and Immigration Commission</i> .....                                                          | 699 |
|                                                       | <i>McKinnon v. Ontario (Ministry of Correctional Services) (No. 3)</i> .....                                                | 703 |
|                                                       | Note: <i>McKinnon v. Ontario (Ministry of Correctional Services) No.7</i> .....                                             | 717 |
|                                                       | <i>Action Travail Des Femmes v. C.N.R. Co.</i> .....                                                                        | 722 |
|                                                       | <i>National Capital Alliance on Race Relations (NCARR) v. Canada (Health and Welfare)</i> .....                             | 736 |
|                                                       | R. Brian Howe & David Johnson, <i>Restraining Equality</i> .....                                                            | 762 |
| <b>11.</b>                                            | <b>OTHER SYSTEMIC INITIATIVES</b>                                                                                           |     |
|                                                       | W.W. Black, <i>Employment Equity: A Systemic Approach</i> .....                                                             | 765 |
|                                                       | “Overview of the <i>Employment Equity Act (1996)</i> From a Public Service Perspective” .....                               | 768 |
|                                                       | Abigail Bakan & Audrey Kobayashi, <i>Employment Equity Policy in Canada: An Interprovincial Comparison</i> .....            | 771 |
|                                                       | <i>Ferrel et al. v. Ontario (Attorney General)</i> .....                                                                    | 788 |
|                                                       | Russell G. Juriansz “The Employment Equity Act Is Dead: Long Live The Employment Equity Act” .....                          | 789 |
| <b>PART V: HUMAN RIGHTS REFORM</b>                    |                                                                                                                             |     |
| <b>12.</b>                                            | <b>RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CHANGE</b>                                                                                           |     |
|                                                       | Ont. Human Rights Code Review Task Force, <i>Achieving Equality</i> .....                                                   | 795 |
|                                                       | “Dysfunction in the Human Rights Complaints System” .....                                                                   | 798 |
|                                                       | M. Hart & G. Sanson, “Filing a Complaint and the New Mediation Procedure” ....                                              | 811 |
|                                                       | Canadian Human Rights Act Review Panel, <i>Promoting Equality</i> .....                                                     | 815 |